

# **Rubblization & HMA Overlay**



Presented by Matt Shinners, Antigo Construction, Inc. at APAM Annual Conference 02/27/2025

# Good morning - WAKE UP!!



# **Presentation Outline**



# **Reflective Cracking of Asphalt Overlay**











# **MHB Badger Breaker**





### **Z-Grid Roller**



### PTR & Smooth Vibratory Rollers



# **HMA Overlay**





#### Antigo Construction's Square Yards of Rubblization in Michigan (1,000s)

### N Shore Drive, Ferrysburg, 1996 – 1<sup>st</sup> MI Project

Owner: City of Ferrysburg Contractor: Lakeside Construction 6" CRCP / HMA Overlay

# N Shore Drive, Ferrysburg, 1996



# N Shore Drive, Ferrysburg, 1996



### USH 23, n/o Milan, 1997

# **Owner: MDOT** Contractor: Thompson-McCully **Design-Build-Warranty Project** 10" JRCP / New 10.5" HMA Overlay w/ SMA.

# USH 23, n/o Milan, 1997



# USH 23, n/o Milan, 1997





9" JRCP / New 6.5" HAM Overlay







#### Maple Road, Saginaw County, 2023 – Modified Rblz

Owner: Saginaw County Contractor: Pyramid Paving & Contracting 7.0" JRCP / New 5" HMA Overlay

# Maple Road, Saginaw County, 2023



# Maple Road, Saginaw County, 2023



### Holt Road, Ingham County, 2024



# Holt Road, Ingham County, 2024



### NEXT: I-96, Livingston County, 2025-26



# I-96, Livingston County, 2025-26



# **Rubblization Best Practices**

- Reuse existing asphalt overlay as intermediate base layer
- Use crushed aggregate as intermediate base layer
- Modified rubblization when weaker base/subgrade support
- ⇒ Partial-depth milling of concrete adjacent to curb & gutter
- Break & seat and crack & seat with MHB
- FAA guidance includes rubblization
- Partial-depth milling of rubblized concrete to control final elevation of asphalt overlay
- ⇒Recent reports

#### Mill overlay, crush, & windrow on shoulder





### Blade crushed millings over rubblized concrete



### Pneumatic-tired roller on crushed millings



### **Rubblize 2<sup>nd</sup> lane**



### Blade crushed millings on 2<sup>nd</sup> lane



### Crush aggregate layer over rubblized concrete



# Antico

# WisDOT addresses modified rubblization in engineer guidance

"Attention must also be paid to constructability. Even if it is possible to produce small particle sizes, the resulting layer must still provide a working platform for paving operations and a stable foundation for the pavement overlay. In cases of isolated, very weak subgrade, subgrade correction may be appropriate. Another way to compensate for weak subgrade is to modify the rubblizing pattern to produce larger particle sizes which maintain more of the existing concrete pavement's structural support. Experience has shown that segments of twelve to eighteen inches in the lower half of the slab are still effective for eliminating reflective cracking."

From Section 3.50 "Rubblizing Concrete Pavement" of the Wisconsin DOT Construction & Materials Manual

# **Full rubblization**



# Modified rubblization – significant spalling



# Modified rubblization – occasional spalling



# **Clearly visible cracks**



# Weak area - should be addressed



# **Antigo's Modified Rubblization Spec**

#### Description

(1) This section describes modified rubblization and the rolling and seating of existing concrete pavement to create a stable construction platform for a pavement overlay either with or without an intermediate base layer.

#### General

(1) Use a self-contained, self-propelled multi-head breaker. Use 10-ton or heavier rollers and roll at 6 feet per second or slower. Run vibratory rollers at an engineer-approved frequency and amplitude. A roller pass is defined as down and back in the same path.

(2) Before rubblizing, saw full-depth joints and completely sever load transfer devices to isolate the rubblized area from areas not to be rubblized. Saw jointed pavements at an existing transverse joint. Do not damage adjacent pavement during rubblization. Repair damage to the adjacent pavement caused by contractor operations as the engineer directs.

#### Modified Rubblization

(1) Fracture the concrete full-depth and uniformly across the pavement width. The engineer will designate one of the two categories of modified rubblization as described below:

#### Modified Rubblization-significant spalling

Achieve 12-inch minus size particles at the surface, significant surface spalling, and a surface appearance that ranges from smooth to pulverized. 75% of the pieces at the bottom of the slab shall be 15" minus in size. The pavement surface should look similar to the surface in the following two pictures:



Modified Rubblization-significant spalling

# Partial-Depth Milling Concrete Adjacent to C&G



### Partial-Depth Milling Concrete Adjacent to C&G





# Break & seat with MHB – Ohio DOT

ODOT special provision: break & seat with MHB, sizing: max 30", majority less than 18", no more than 20% greater than 24"

# Crack & seat with MHB – Iowa Counties





# FAA Design Guidance Includes Rubblization

# FAA Advisory Circular 150/5320-6G, Airport Pavement Design and Evaluation, issued June 7, 2021

https://www.faa.gov/documentLibrary/media/Advisory\_ Circular/150-5320-6G-Pavement-Design.pdf

1. Purpose.

This advisory circular (AC) provides guidance to the public on the design and evaluation of pavements used by aircraft at civil airports.

# FAA Design Guidance Includes Rubblization

4.1.5 When considering pavement reconstruction, inplace recycling methods such as full depth reclamation of flexible pavement and rubblization of rigid pavements may be cost-effective alternatives to removal of the existing pavement section.

# FAA Design Guidance Includes Rubblization

4.9.3.2 The thickness design procedure for an overlay over a rubblized concrete base is similar to a new flexible or new rigid pavement design. In FAARFIELD, model the rubblized concrete pavement layer as a user defined layer with recommended modulus values ranging from 100,000 to 400,000 psi.

# FAA Design Guidance Includes Rubblization

4.9.3.3 Use engineering judgment when selecting the appropriate modulus value to characterize the rubblized concrete pavement layer. Many factors influence the modulus of the rubblized layer including: the thickness, strength and particle size of the rubblized layer, the condition and type of base, subbase and subgrade materials. Refer to AAPTP Report 04-01, Development of **Guidelines for Rubblization, and Engineering Brief 66, Rubblized Portland Cement Concrete Base Course, for** further information.

### Milling 5"-6" of rubblized concrete surface





# Antigo's Airfield Rubblization in MI

Year	Contractor	Location	Project Limits	County	PCC Type	Thickness	Quantity (SY)	HMA Overlay
2002	Michigan Paving & Materials	Kalamazoo/Battle Creek AP	Taxiway "E"	Kalamazoo	JRCP	08"	5,250	11.5"
2002	Dan's Excavating	Selfridge ANG	Runway 01-19	Macomb	JPCP	13-21"	95,706	7"
2006	Northwest Airlines	Detroit Airport	Test on Connector W-1	Wayne	JRCP	17"	625	n/a





NCAT Report 20-03

BENEFITS OF REHABILITATING CONCRETE PAVEMENTS WITH SLAB FRACTURING AND ASPHALT OVERLAYS

> By Randy West Fan Gu Benjamin F. Bowers

> > May 2020



277 Technology Parkway = Auburn, AL 36830

#### Google: NCAT 20-03

- "The primary objective of this project was to synthesize both the historical and most recent experiences with C&S, B&S, and rubblization methods for the rehabilitation of PCC pavements with asphalt overlays."

- "Rubblized PCC with asphalt overlay had very good performance including resistance to transverse cracking distress, which implies that rubblization practically inhibits reflective cracking."

>>> IS-117



#### GUIDELINES FOR USE OF **ASPHALT OVERLAYS** TO REHABILITATE PCC PAVEMENTS

Adriana Vargas-Nordcbeck, Ph.D. Nam H. Tran, Ph.D., P.E., LEED GA

National Center for Asphalt Technology At Auburn University

#### Google: NAPA IS-117

#### Contents:

-

-

-

- Rehabilitation considerations
- Reflection cracking of HMA overlays
- Slab fracturing process
- Structural design of asphalt overlay
- Mix design for asphalt overlays
  - Case studies

January 2024

# **Rubblization & HMA = Sustainability**

- 1. Existing concrete pavement and base recycled in-place reduces need for new materials.
- 2. Reduction in truck movements and equipment usage when compared to full-depth reconstruction reduces emissions.
- 3. Good long-term performance of asphalt overlay.
- 4. Asphalt surface can be replaced as needed over time leaving rubblized layer as is (perpetual pavement).
- 5. Accelerated construction reduces impact on travelling public and reduces associated emissions.

# Antico



CIVIL ENGINEERING STUDIES Illinois Center for Transportation Series No. 21-005 UILU-ENG-2021-2005 ISSN: 0197-9191

#### Performance of Interstate Rubblization in Illinois

Prepared By David L. Lippert Marshall R. Thompson University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Charles J. Wienrank Illinois Department of Transportation

Research Report No. FHWA-ICT-21-005

A report of the findings of

ICT PROJECT R27-193-2 Flexible Pavement Design (Full-depth Asphalt and Rubblization)

https://doi.org/10.36501/0197-9191/21-005

Illinois Center for Transportation July 2021 Good Pavement Performance = Sustainability

# Antico



Figure 1. Map. Locations of interstate rubblization projects in Illinois.

#### **CHAPTER 5: FINDINGS**

As a result of this study, several findings can be made as to the current state of the practice of rubblizing design, construction, and performance in Illinois, as follows:

 Overall, rubblization is providing good to excellent performance and exceeding design expectations.

• The design process is conservative. Fatigue cracking has not been observed in the original rehabilitation, which is providing service beyond the design traffic. Overlays that result in no additional structure (mill and fill) are not experiencing fatigue cracking.

• Rutting is not excessive and is similar to full-depth HMA. The exception is one project on I-57 (mile post 29.6–32.1 southbound) in which rutting was attributed to a level binder layer being added under the surface to make up for thin pavement.



#### Evaluation of Rubblized Pavement Sections in Michigan Constructed between 1988 and 2002

#### **Final Report**

December 2006



Prepared for: Antigo Construction, Inc. P.O. Box 12 2520 N. Clermont St. Antigo, WI 54409

Prepared by: Applied Pavement Technology, Inc. 115 W. Main St., Suite 400 Urbana, IL 61801 Phone: (217) 398-3977 • Fax: (217) 398-4027 Is it time for an updated study of Michigan rubblization and HMA overlay projects?



### **Questions & Answers**





## **Antigo Construction Family of Companies**

# 715-627-2222

# ac@antigoconstruction.com www.antigoconstruction.com

2520 Clermont St Antigo, WI 54409 USA